

Danner, Ward

From: Paul Rosenfeld Ph.D. <rosenfeld.paul@gmail.com>
Sent: Sunday, December 22, 2013 7:21 PM
To: 'Ken Miller'; hughbkaufman@comcast.net
Cc: jd18@me.com; simonianl@aol.com; 'cassandra wiseman'; 'cami'; 'paula dinerstein'; 'Jeff Ruch'; 'joy horowitz'; 'Hope Edelman'; 'Jennifer DENICOLA'; 'NiColle Holland'; 'Cindy Vador'; 'stephanie smith'; 'Christina Pascucci'; 'melissa'; 'dave'; Armann, Steve; Wilson, Patrick; 'Greg Mitchell'; 'felicity barringer'; 'Robin Bravender'; 'Randy Loftis'; 'Juliet Eilperin'
Subject: Dr. Rosenfeld's Analysis- Malibu High School Needs A Thorough Investigation and Remediation.

Importance: High

Follow Up Flag: Follow up
Flag Status: Flagged

Dear Concerned Parents: I have evaluated the data provided to me, but I actually had to submit Freedom of Information Act request to get the data in adobe acrobat. I was provided some data from school district, but was surprised the school district did not provide all of the data to me after requesting it. I had to manually enter the data into excel and it was extremely time consuming. It is very confusing to understand what exactly was done for there is no report supporting the data. The data collected thus far shows there to be significant concentrations of PCBs that require remediation via the Toxic Substance Control Act. My understanding is the School is going to investigate and remediate, but the methods and work plan should be written down for everyone to review. The concept that it may have been recommended that PCB air sampling be conducted with the windows open may make the past sampling suspect. But there is a lot of misinformation, so I do not know what is true or false. I do not want to speculate and there have been so many emails it is hard to know what the facts are.

Summary Of Dr. Rosenfeld's Findings:

1. 4 of 10 caulk samples exceeded 50 parts per million and require remediation via the Toxic Substance Control Act. In some instances caulk can have PCB concentrations as high as 300,000 parts per million. The highest caulk sample in Malibu had 1868 parts per million, and requires remediation.
2. 4 of 33 wipe samples exceeded the TSCA value of 10 micrograms per 100 cm square requiring remediation. More wipe sampling needs to be conducted.
3. More air sampling should be conducted especially on a hot day. The air samples show PCBs in the air but they were not above the Screening Levels published by the EPA for schools during the sampling period. The highest PCB levels found in a room were ~ 57 nanograms per cubic meter. The screening level for children ages 1 to 3 is 70 nanograms per cubic meter, but 450 and 600 nanograms per cubic meter for children from 12-15 and 15 to 18 respectively. I am not sure if the past samples were collected properly or not. Some individuals say that anything above 1 nanogram per cubic meter is too high.
4. It appears that there are about 10 paint samples that were collected, but it is not clear exactly how the samples were collected or what the data means.
5. The school should have a written a report explaining the past analysis, and a written work plan explaining how the future investigation and remediation are to take place. It is very unusual that this has not been done.
6. The question regarding the other contaminants is extremely valid and does need to be addressed.
7. I would suggest taking many more samples of caulk around the school to determine the significance of the PCB contamination though out the school in order to adequately remediate. Using method 8082 my firm could take 100 PCB samples of caulk around the school for \$7000 using a lab called CalScience (plus time and material) to figure out where the PCB contaminated material is around the school. It would end up costing close to \$30,000 with my firms time, travel and lab fees. So far only 10 caulk samples were taken and it was basically a screening analysis. Under TSCA the school must remediate the contaminated material above 50 parts per million, and it is not clear how that is to be done.

I am happy to work with the parents or the school district in the future and understand your concerns, but I would need to work on a time and material basis.

Let me know if you want me to continue assisting Malibu Parents For Healthy Schools.

Best Wishes,
Respectfully,

Paul Rosenfeld Ph.D.
Soil Water Air Protection Enterprise (SWAPE)
1640 5th Street, Suite 204, Santa Monica, CA 90401
Phone: 310-795-2335 Fax: 310-434-0011
prosenfeld@swape.com
WWW.SWAPE.COM

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE The information in this E-mail message is legally privileged and confidential, and is intended only for the use of the individual(s) named as recipient(s). Unless you are a named recipient of this E-mail, you should not read, distribute, or otherwise use this E-mail, and you should immediately notify the sender by reply email or by calling 310-795-2335. Thank you.